

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

looked at him as the Babe Ruth. I still do. He's the Babe Ruth. He was my hero and is my hero, but that was a different time. That was a time when there was nothing like Hatzalah. He invented this organization and they helped and they continue to help the community.

Ezras Nashim is not a competitive force. It's dealing with a need. Yes, maybe the response time, as Mr. Reisner is saying, is not what he considers parallel to Hatzalah and maybe there's other factors because I don't see statistics being presented here. I don't see numbers. When I look at fact-checking, I want to look at data. I need to look at a control group and I have to look at the individual variations. Where are they getting these numbers from? When I look at a peer review journal, I have to see hard data, not hearsay from anyone and that requires data and that requires a community that can have both.

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

And I think it -- it really upsets me because I love Hatzalah. I think that Ezras Nashim is really here to help. It's not here to go against Hatzalah and I think that the woman that stood before, if their husbands are at Hatzalah, she commended them, that their husbands leave at 2 o'clock in the morning, but look at all these women that are willing to give up their home life to run out and help other women. That should be commended. Thank you.

(Whereupon, applause was given.)

HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Thank you, Dr. Blitman. You said you have some people --

MR. DERING: Yes.

(Whereupon, Ms. Schmidt approached the microphone.)

HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Yeah, so I will ask for brevity as a soul of wit and it's also going to make my life so much better. So I appreciate your presence here tonight. Thank you.

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

MS. SCHMIDT: Hello, everybody.

My name is Rachel Schmidt. Many of you know me. I am a psychotherapist in private practice. I service the Borough Park community and the Williamsburg community as well. I graduated from Yeshiva University, schools of Wurtzvalor (phonetic) in 1991. More important than that, I am a proud Orthodox woman raised in the hub of the Hasidic community of Borough Park. I understand the need of the community.

We're here today to discuss the need of an applicant service for Ezras Nashim. Allow me to explain: Orthodox women are raised in a very modest way and modesty is our badge of honor. There is nothing more sacred to an orthodox woman than her modesty. Not her money, not her house, not her jewelry. My modesty is the most important thing to me in my whole life, personally speaking, but I'm not here to speak about myself. I'm here to speak

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 for my clients. I'm here to speak for
3 the community of women. They should
4 have choices.

5 Now, that young lady who
6 spoke, that she called Hatzalah,
7 congratulations to you. I'm glad you
8 made that decision. That was your
9 choice, but I want to have a choice;
10 that if I prefer a female educated
11 professional medical service, that I
12 want to have that choice to have that
13 professional medical service at my side.

14 I want to say, I love Hatzalah.
15 There is nobody that I appreciate and
16 there is nobody I respect more than
17 Hatzalah. It's just only in this area
18 that we have a difference. Go ahead, do
19 your good word. God will pay you back,
20 but please let Ezras Nashim do their
21 work as well. Make room for another
22 organization. Make room so that the
23 women who prefer a professional medical
24 service that they can have that choice.

25 The Orthodox woman as you were

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

mentioned before from the age of -- does not shake hands -- from the age of 3, we cover our elbows. We wear high neck. We wear long dresses. We wear tights. And you know what? Our little children, they don't look at iPhones. My grandchildren -- may I mention, I'm also a mother, a grandmother, and a great-grandmother and my grandchildren do not touch an iPhone. That is how sacred modesty is to them. They do not want to come into looking at a picture where they can possibly see a woman in a bathing suit, where there could possibly be a woman not dressed modestly. For that one reason, my grandchildren do not touch an iPhone and neither does my daughter-in-law for that matter.

My point is, that these children growing up in this restricted modest society who don't even know who Mickey Mouse is. Ask my grandchildren: Who is Mickey Mouse? They will say, "which mouse? The mouse that ran away with the

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 cheese?" They don't even know what
3 you're talking about.

4 Now, I want to just let you know
5 that this is the culture. I'm not
6 saying that there's anything wrong with
7 your child watching Mickey Mouse. Don't
8 go away with that. What I'm saying is:
9 Our children are so protected. Our
10 little girls are wearing long tights.
11 Now, you take this little girl and she
12 grows up and she's trained to live a
13 good healthy intimate life, a life with
14 her husband, but her husband and only,
15 and suddenly, she's in an emergency
16 situation. She has to give birth and
17 now suddenly, she feels that she has no
18 choice. Her modesty is ripped off.
19 Ladies and gentleman, she feels
20 emotionally raped.

21 I promise you I'm not
22 exaggerating and I speak as a
23 psychotherapist, LCSW. I have a full
24 practice -- please don't call me. And I
25 represent the people who have not just

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

-- I cannot speak about my personal clients. I'm sure you could understand that, but I can represent the community I can represent my children. I can represent my sisters. I can represent the females to whom also modesty is the most sacred possession that they have. Please, I appeal to you, I beg you, allow us to continue to be modest.

If you look at the history, if you look at biblical times, you will see it has always been women helping women. 100 years ago, it was women helping women. I was -- my mother gave birth to me 67 years ago with a midwife and she did pretty well I think; ask my husband. So what -- I'm not putting away doctors. Of course we need doctors, please. I'm only saying that the woman should have a choice; that if she's in an emergency vulnerable stage, please I beg you, allow her to maintain her dignity. Allow her to maintain her modesty. Allow her to give birth a healthy,

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

healthy child without having to make the compromise not on the health of the child and not have to make a compromise on her modesty.

I just want to let you know, I spoke -- I remember I gave a lecture three years ago, my husband, Honorable Judge David Schmidt was inaugurated as a civil court judge and many people spoke, and so did I. And when I got up to speak for my husband, do you know what I said? I will say it to you in two sentences. I said, Gentleman, I want to thank you so much for holding my husband in. This is America. America, a country, a country of justice and may I ask you American citizens, may I ask you a favor? When you come up to congratulate me and my sisters and my girlfriends, please refrain from shaking my hands. And I will take your congratulations, but please do not shake my hands and that was my whole speech, Gentleman -- Ladies.

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

I have nothing more to say because if I have my modesty, I have everything. If I don't have my modesty -- I don't need my husband to be criminal judge or a supreme judge or any judge. There nothing more important to me than my modesty.

I was walking on the beach, on the boardwalk in New Jersey in the summer and of course I was dressed not much different than you see me right now. An elderly old lady came over to me. She was wearing a bikini and she said to me, "how can you wear such long sleeves and hide that in such heat. And you know what I said to her? With pride.

(Whereupon, applause was given.)

When you have pride, you can do anything. When you have pride -- and I go swimming at the beach, I'm dressed pretty much the same way. With pride -- pride is the gas to the car. Pride is oxygen to the soul. With pride, you can

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 accomplish anything. And I'm going to
3 leave you off with a story, of not my
4 client, but a friend of mine who told me
5 this story.

6 She was in labor and the labor
7 was coming quickly. She had no choice.
8 She called Hatzalah. Who showed up?
9 Her best friend's husband. This is a
10 guy she sees almost every Sabbath. This
11 is the guy she (Hebrew term) in
12 synagogue on Friday night --

13 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN:
14 Ms. Schmidt, I think you're an elegant
15 speaker and you certainly have got my
16 attention and if you -- you probably
17 could regale us with many incidents.

18 MS. SCHMIDT: Okay.

19 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: And I
20 don't mean to be rude or curt, but I do
21 need to move us along.

22 MS. SCHMIDT: Okay.

23 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: If you
24 could, summarize.

25 MS. SCHMIDT: I'm going to

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 summarize by saying that I represent the
3 Orthodox community. I'm a clinical
4 psychotherapist, LCSW and I want to
5 speak for the voice of the ladies who
6 are not here. Please give us a chance
7 so that we can hold on to our modesty.
8 Please give us the ambulance so that we
9 can do that.

10 (Whereupon, applause was given.)

11 MR. DERING: My other witness
12 who is set to leave with Ms. Schmidt is
13 Toby Kain. I think her comments will be
14 briefer. Can we get her in please?

15 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Sure.
16 I want to be as accommodating as we can.

17 MR. DERING: Thank you.

18 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: And
19 tell me again, please, Toby Kain?

20 MR. DERING: Toby Kain.

21 (Whereupon, Ms. Kain approached
22 the microphone.)

23 MS. KAIN: Good evening and
24 thank you for allowing me to speak. My
25 name is Toby Cane and I'm a Hasidic

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

mother, grandmother and
great-grandmother. I am the child of
Holocaust survivors and I was raised,
and raised my family as well, following
the strict rules of modesty.

We are proud to follow these
rules, which relate to how we dress and
how we interact, mostly with regard to
interaction between men and women. We
follow these rules with sincerity and
devotion. On the eve of Rosh Hashanah,
two years ago, the Jewish New Year and
High Holiday, I accidentally dropped a
huge pot steaming hot chicken soup,
which spilled all over the kitchen floor
and would leave me falling in the middle
of it all.

While in excruciating pain, I
crawled out of the boiling hot soup into
the bathroom. I took one look at the
lower part of my body and saw blisters
forming on my buttocks, thigh, and legs.
I was at a loss and knew I needed help
fast, but I was determined that I would

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

not allow any man to look at my injuries because they were in an area that I would not expose to strange men.

Wasting precious time, I was in a dilemma and did not know how to get help. I called my sister and she suggested that I call Ezras Nashim, which I did, and they came immediately. While I had heard of Ezras Nashim before this accident, it never occurred to me that I would need them. It was only when I was hurt and in pain and my private body parts were hurt did I feel the trauma of not wanting a strange man to see me.

My reluctance to call for men is a result of our Hasidic culture. The care I received was professional while I felt completely comfortable. I shutter when I think as to what could have happened if not for Ezras Nashim. They came twice a day to dress my wounds, clean them, and apply the necessary cream. Thank you, Ezras Nashim for

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 treating me and making my ordeal less
3 traumatic and at the same time,
4 preserving my dignity. Thank you.

5 Whereupon, applause was given.)

6 MR. REISNER: Hearing Officer,
7 I'm sorry, but I've got one rabbi who
8 needs to give a lecture somewhere else.
9 If we could indulge him.

10 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I would
11 love to and I apologize to the rabbi,
12 but the rabbi will give me the privacy
13 of doing this. We're going to need to
14 try and move us along. I'm told that we
15 need to be out at a time that is
16 forthcoming. We're going to be cutting
17 people to about three minutes or so
18 unless that is a huge problem. I'm
19 going to adjourn the hearing for a
20 five-minute period and I will be glad to
21 accommodate the rabbi after our
22 five-minute recess.

23 (Whereupon, a recess was taken
24 at this time.)

25 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Thank

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 you for allowing me to resume being
3 semi-comfortable. I'm told that we have
4 another witness who is going to be
5 coming. Is it Rabbi Weinberger?

6 MR. REISNER: Kaufman, please.

7 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Rabbi
8 Kaufman is going to speak next. So,
9 just so we're super clear, I'm not going
10 to -- I don't mean to cut any testimony
11 off or limit anyone, I would ask people
12 to be mindful and respectful of time as
13 I attempted and that's my intent and if
14 would could all keep that as our focus
15 and our intent to be respectful as we go
16 forward with the remaining witnesses.

17 Rabbi Kaufman, are you --

18 MR. REISNER: Hearing officer
19 Schorn, if I may, just for the record, I
20 would like to make a request that the
21 Hearing Officer take under advisement
22 the text of 06-06 at page 5 of 30, which
23 says, "the complete application is the
24 basis for the demonstration of need and
25 public hearing applicant may be

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 restricted to corroborating and/or
3 explaining the data therein." And I
4 would ask that we proceed accordingly
5 going forward and I would further ask
6 that additional information that has
7 been testified to be dis-acknowledged by
8 the Hearing Officer in his
9 consideration.

10 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Okay.
11 You're also asking me to un-ring a bell,
12 but I'm going to try to do that anyway.
13 So we had a brief conversation between
14 yourself -- if I'm not right,
15 Mr. Reisner and Mr. Dering, that if
16 there seems to be some information that
17 is new, according to the rules, that was
18 not contained within the application in
19 chief that was submitted, when it was
20 submitted, that you will advise so that
21 it will be as best not considered when I
22 am making my recommendation to the
23 Ambulance Committee and the Ambulance
24 Committee will then be advised and
25 instructed not to consider something

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 that was not in the original
3 application. Is that consistent with
4 what we have discussed, Mr. Reisner?

5 MR. REISNER: I believe that is
6 what is consistent with your proposal,
7 Hearing Officer.

8 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: And is
9 that consistent with 06-06?

10 MR. REISNER: I don't believe
11 that there is language within 06-06 that
12 speaks to that technical procedure.

13 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I
14 agree, but are we with the spirit?

15 MR. REISNER: I am hesitant to
16 say that we are.

17 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Okay.
18 So, what am I doing wrong? And keep it
19 less than an hour.

20 MR. REISNER: I think that the
21 key is that, as the Hearing Officer, you
22 need to exercise your discretion to
23 limit the testimony to corroborating or
24 explaining the content, the data, within
25 the application.

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: All
right. So, here is what I can't do:
I'm not going to go and shut down
someone who is testifying and speaking
from the community, because they are
speaking from a place which is not
legalistic where you, I, Mr. Dering are
coming from. So I think I would be
wrong if I were to shut them down. I'd
ask them to be concise. I think that
would be appropriate. I think that
certain things --

MR. REISNER: May I interject?

HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Will
have more weight than others and if
something is irrelevant, it's not going
to be considered, I think wisely so.
And I think on that basis, I don't want
to be curtailing speech or otherwise.

MR. REISNER: I agree with that
and I note that this portion of 06-06
that I cited pertains to the applicant
only, not people from the community
speaking in support.

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Okay.

3 MR. REISNER: I do particularly
4 take issue with some of the testimony
5 that's been given today on behalf of
6 Ezras Nashim, however, and I would ask
7 that that information is disregarded to
8 the extent that you, as the Hearing
9 Officer, are able to ascertain that it
10 is not explaining or clarifying the
11 information in the application.

12 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I will
13 do my best and I trust at your good
14 offices that you'll be able to identify
15 for me what you feel would be
16 inappropriate and you'll let me know in
17 a timely fashion once you get a copy of
18 the transcript.

19 MR. REISNER: I will be happy to
20 do so. I am hopeful --

21 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I'm not
22 going to rely on you. No disrespect. I
23 will do my own best. I don't mean to be
24 at all disrespectful. I will do my best
25 on my end. I'm not going to wait for

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 you, but I will do my best to separate
3 wheat from chaff, if we can use that
4 analogy, but if you need to just
5 identify and help me, I'll accept from
6 Counsel as well.

7 MR. REISNER: Thank you.

8 MR. DERING: I would just like
9 to make a point. You know, the
10 information that's provided on behalf of
11 Ezras Nashim has been corroborating and
12 explanatory with regard to the
13 application. I would just like the
14 opportunity that if my adversary is
15 going to make an argument that something
16 for some reason isn't that, I really
17 need the opportunity to respond to that.

18 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Oh, I
19 absolutely want you to. I actually want
20 you to. So, it's not unilateral. It's
21 definitely -- you both are. Again, I'm
22 looking at this in a very holistic
23 approach. I'm looking at this from
24 substantive justice. I'm looking at
25 this so that the community is heard.

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 There was the applicant, one of
3 your supporters had made a comment about
4 the 12 ladies, the ladies from Borough
5 Park. I appreciate the fact that we
6 have ladies from Borough Park. I
7 appreciate the fact that on whatever
8 side, that there this passion, that
9 there is this interest, and I thank
10 everyone here from wherever you are and
11 whatever your viewpoint and appreciate
12 that it's being done with respect.

13 MR. DERING: Great.

14 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: And I'm
15 going to try and maintain that with
16 myself and I hope that that spirit is
17 emanating from me as well. And you said
18 that Rabbi Kaufman is ready?

19 MR. REISNER: Yes.

20 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Rabbi,
21 good evening again.

22 (Whereupon, Rabbi Kaufman
23 approached the microphone.)

24 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Rabbi,
25 I'm not going to curtail you, but I'm

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 sure you'll be --

3 RABBI KAUFMAN: This is not a
4 sermon.

5 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Okay.
6 Thank you, Rabbi.

7 RABBI KAUFMAN: First of all, I
8 thank the Hearing Officer for allowing
9 me to speak today and in such an
10 advanced format and all the other people
11 who were ahead, but I've been sitting
12 here patiently listening to the passion,
13 listening to the women here who are so
14 concerned about tznius, [modesty.]

15 These are our mothers. These
16 are our grandmothers. They reflect the
17 whole basis of our Judaism. They
18 reflect what we stand for. These are
19 the people who are the ones who are the
20 y'sod (phonetic), the foundation on our
21 houses and our households, and that's
22 why we are the way we look in certain
23 areas, not better or different, but
24 that's the way that we -- that's what
25 our mothers lived through the fire for,

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 for modesty and God forbid for anything
3 else and there's stories, and stories,
4 and stories.

5 However, I am here today -- my
6 name is Rabbi Yechiel Kaufman. I'm a
7 life-long member of this community and I
8 was asked by the leading rabbis of our
9 communities, rabbis who represent the
10 majority of Hasidic and Orthodox Jewish
11 population residing in Brooklyn, New
12 York's community who respectfully
13 request that the Council members
14 consider the letters signed by them and
15 was sent to the Council as our position
16 against the approval of Ezras Nashim's
17 new ambulance application currently
18 under review by the Council.

19 And I don't envy the two
20 counsels here and you Mr. Hearing
21 Officer trying to navigate this
22 dangerous terrain: Yes religious, not
23 religious. Is it modesty or not
24 modesty? And this is something which is
25 so wholly important to us and you know,

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

it's something that we really hold so dear; however, I here represent those rabbis who are the ones who give us those rulings. Those ones who interpret to the strictest letter of the law of the law of modesty. And they're the ones who are telling us that in this case, modesty does not apply. And I'll tell you why.

As rabbinic leaders of Brooklyn's Hasidic Orthodox Jewish community, we are charged with and thoroughly familiar with the Jewish laws of modesty, as well as the importance in Jewish law regarding the saving of life and our community's practical needs, which we deal with continuously. We have considered the modesty issue in the overall analysis of the benefits of the community many times over the years by considering the religious and practical elements and factors in the issue.

We have concluded that the associated risk in having two emergency

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

services is so disparate and different in their capacities, in their abilities can reap and deliver the emergency needs of the one community, those risks far outweigh of benefits of the community. A new ambulance service is a detriment to our community since it adds no help to our community in the division of emergency service is absolutely not required from a modesty perspective and in fact reduces the health and safety of the community.

This is so since the new applicant's services cannot compare to the Hatzalah's 50 years of experience in the provision of these services. Its vast network of paramedics, EMTs, and physicians staffing its operation, its speed in responding to calls, its 50 ambulances based in the Borough of Brooklyn and Hatzalah's constant upgrading of equipment, an expanding of services to meet the needs in our community, which thank God, is growing.

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

Another problem is the fact the community is used to dealing with only one phone number for all its emergencies. We are opposed to Ezras Nashim's new ambulance service primarily for the following reasons:

Number one, Chevra Hatzalah, which is the primary EMS service utilized by the Hasidic and Orthodox Jewish community throughout the City of New York has for the past 50 years provided and continues to provide unparalleled care with the shortest response time of any EMS system in the United States.

The average response time in the community for emergencies is approximately two minutes from when the call is received by a Hatzalah dispatcher, as opposed to the stated Ezras Nashim's response time of eight minutes and two seconds. Hatzalah's quick response time is made possible by the large number of individual EMTs and

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 paramedics and over 50 ambulances in
3 Brooklyn alone. At this point in time,
4 and for a good additional period, a new
5 service cannot meet this level of
6 service, thereby imperiling the
7 receiving community.

8 Number two, having multiple
9 volunteer EMS services operating in and
10 servicing the same community will cause
11 confusion as to whom to call in an
12 emergency, thereby causing delays in
13 providing emergency care and potentially
14 causing catastrophe. Additionally, when
15 an emergency occurs, multiple agencies
16 will be routinely called, namely both
17 Hatzalah and Ezras Nashim services.
18 This will reflect itself in overuse of
19 the two services for no good purpose.

20 Number three, we disagree with
21 Ezras Nashim's claim that patients feel
22 humiliated when treated by neighbors.
23 Hatzalah members act with the utmost
24 sensitivity and confidentiality. They
25 are professionals of the highest caliber

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

and with continuous emergency medicine and sensitivity training to the point that when a Hatzalah member receives a phone call that there is an emergency and he sees that that call, that this may be someone who knows him intimately, or as neighbor, he makes sure to pass it over to the next one who is right there not wasting any time, because he is sensitive to the fact that the person may not want to be serviced by him on the scene.

Number four, and this is the last one, we are deeply disturbed by the allegation raised by Ezras Nashim in regards to Hatzalah. Hatzalah is an organization that has been instrumental in our communities for the last 50 years, treating men, women, and children alike and has saved and continues to save countless lives on a daily basis.

We agree, from the modesty perspective of Jewish law, there is no need to form another organization. It

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

is therefore the steadfast position of the leading rabbis in our community -- the rabbis who represent a majority of constituents of Hasidic and Orthodox Jewish population residing in the Brooklyn, New York community, rabbis who have counselled and advised are sought all over the world, people who are luminaries in the Jewish law, in Jewish prudence, especially those pertaining modesty, because that's the code, what we live by and we die buy, modesty -- they have come to the conclusion that granting Ezras Nashim an ambulance certificate will be detrimental to our community and culture and we respectfully ask that you deny this application.

HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Thank you, Rabbi. Rabbi, you have an opportunity for questions.

MR. DERING: Rabbi, I would like to respectfully ask you some questions.

Did you speak with Ezras Nashim

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 prior to signing that statement?

3 RABBI KAUFMAN: No.

4 MR. DERING: Did you speak with
5 Hatzalah prior to signing that
6 statement?

7 RABBI KAUFMAN: I spoke with
8 community members. Some of those
9 community members may be members of
10 Hatzalah, but I spoke to community
11 members and the rabbis. That's the one
12 predominantly who I spoke to.

13 MR. DERING: Did any of those
14 rabbis speak with anyone from Ezras
15 Nashim to ask their side?

16 RABBI KAUFMAN: I have no idea
17 and I think that that's for a different
18 discussion, not for this forum, to make
19 peace between the two of us.

20 MR. DERING: I think it's a
21 different issue. My understanding and
22 by all means -- I'm not -- my
23 understanding is, a matter of Jewish
24 law, to make a decision that it's custom
25 or a law to get input from both sides;

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 is that true?

3 RABBI KAUFMAN: 100 percent.

4 MR. DERING: And so why didn't
5 that happen here?

6 RABBI KAUFMAN: I believe that
7 the rabbis who are members of the
8 community are well-versed in the
9 situation as you've heard from the
10 previous speakers. This has been going
11 on for five years and maybe even much
12 longer and they have a very detailed
13 knowledge of what's going on and I think
14 that is the basis of their comments to
15 this letter.

16 MR. DERING: A few more
17 questions. The letter indicates that
18 there has been a determination that
19 modesty doesn't apply. That's a
20 determination of the standpoint of
21 Jewish law; is that correct?

22 RABBI KAUFMAN: In an emergency
23 situation, when volunteer emergency
24 professionals come in a life-threatening
25 situation, then that's what you have to

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 think about first.

3 MR. DERING: Sure, but that's as
4 a matter of Jewish law. In other words,
5 the statement made by the rabbi that
6 modesty doesn't apply, that's a
7 conclusion based on Jewish law. I'm
8 just trying to understand that that's a
9 Jewish legal conclusion.

10 RABBI KAUFMAN: That's what the
11 rabbis deal with, Jewish law.

12 MR. DERING: Okay. Sure, and so
13 that's a Jewish legal determination, but
14 then how do those rabbis trump the
15 feelings of the women from a cultural
16 standpoint? You might conclude that
17 it's legally okay, but the whole issue
18 here is that culturally, they feel it's
19 not okay, and I'm just putting it in
20 context and respectfully, but how can a
21 group of men determine what's
22 appropriate for women?

23 (Whereupon, applause was given.)

24 RABBI KAUFMAN: Very good
25 question. Let me tell you. The Jewish

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

life circulates around the Jewish law. Jewish law is interpreted by the rabbis for everyone, from conception until death, whether it's an end of life issue or beginning of life issue and everything in between, whether it's a business that you go to, whether it's a marriage that you go. Everything is consulted with the rabbi and the rabbi, based on his knowledge of the Torah and rules, gives his ruling what it should be and therefore, this has been going on for generations.

Number two, the rabbis have women too. They have wives. They have sisters. They have daughters. They have neighbors. They have mothers. They don't live in a vacuum. They know what is a woman's life. Take a look at the thousands of women who support Hatzalah members. Every single one of them is a woman who has the same feeling as every woman who comes here passionately talking. They're not

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 there. You know why? They're at home
3 to take care of their kids while their
4 members, their husbands are at the
5 Hatzalah calls. So it's not in a
6 vacuum. Rabbis do not (Hebrew term).

7 By the way, I want to clarify
8 the statement before. I spoke to the
9 community leaders, some of who may be
10 Hatzalah members. I just don't want you
11 to think I only spoke to Hatzalah
12 members. I want to make it very clear,
13 so that, you know, I did have -- and as
14 far as Ezras Nashim is concerned, I read
15 about it in the papers. I looked it up
16 in articles that they wrote up and I
17 think they are great people.

18 MR. DERING: Sure.

19 RABBI KAUFMAN: And they're very
20 dedicated. You saw the passion.

21 MR. DERING: Yes.

22 RABBI KAUFMAN: It's
23 unbelievable. You can pick it up with a
24 spoon. It was there; however, no one is
25 denying that and no one wants to in the

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 least way to diminish that compassion.
3 Those are our mothers. These are my
4 daughters. These are the people exactly
5 what you heard expressed over here.

6 MR. DERING: Sure.

7 RABBI KAUFMAN: Throughout the
8 generation and the millennium until the
9 Messiah will come; however, we need to
10 follow the dictums of the rabbis who
11 interpret these laws and in this case,
12 not in all the cases, modesty is the
13 greatest thing that we live and abide
14 by, but in this case, they have
15 determined that when it comes to an
16 emergency situation, then you cannot
17 look at modesty and God forbid leave
18 alone the emergency case.

19 Now, we heard of a Hatzalah
20 member who did not want to touch this
21 lady because of his religious
22 restrictions. Well, I don't think 99
23 percent of the Hatzalah members would do
24 that, because they know that life is the
25 most important thing in Jewish law. We

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 can violate the whole Torah in order to
3 keep life and that's why on Shabbas, the
4 highest and the biggest and the holiest
5 day of the year, or Rosh Hashannah, or
6 Yom Kippur, the highest of holiest day,
7 you see Hatzalah members running out
8 there desecrating the Shabbas, trying to
9 save lives.

10 MR. DERING: Sure.

11 RABBI KAUFMAN: Because lives is
12 the most important and when it comes to
13 modesty, which is extremely important in
14 contract with saving lives, our rabbis
15 have ruled that that does not apply to
16 this case.

17 MR. DERING: Thank you. Let me
18 ask you this question and it's my last
19 one. So if I could, I'm trying to
20 figure out the best way to pose it, but
21 so, what we've heard today is that
22 because of the cultural concept of
23 modesty that some women, even though
24 there might be an exception in Jewish
25 law, if they're treated by a man in an

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 emergency situation, they can feel a
3 level of trauma; so it's like a
4 secondary, you know, a second injury to
5 whatever their over injury is. Do you
6 think that -- you mentioned response
7 times with regard to ambulances. Do you
8 think that faster response times trump a
9 secondary injury as a result of those
10 services?

11 RABBI KAUFMAN: Well, I just
12 know common sense would dictate if a man
13 or woman needs to get to the hospital,
14 you get them as quick as you can and you
15 don't have anything blocking you from
16 getting them to the hospital. That's
17 common sense. I'm not sure what would
18 trump what. Now, you're dealing with
19 feelings of individual people and then
20 you're dealing with community
21 application. These are two different
22 things that have to be noted. Yes,
23 there may be some people who feel that
24 way; however, this -- we're talk about a
25 direction to take for a community in

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 order to be culturally sensitive to
3 their religious needs and to that point,
4 the idea of modesty, when somebody's
5 life is in danger, then a person has to
6 deal with that situation first.

7 MR. DERING: And then one more
8 question.

9 RABBI KAUFMAN: I have all night
10 now that I'm speaking.

11 MR. DERING: So, if a segment of
12 the community feels that because of
13 their value of modesty and it can be
14 traumatic to them, why shouldn't they be
15 given the choice to fill the need where
16 they don't have to go through that
17 trauma?

18 RABBI KAUFMAN: I would suggest
19 -- may I suggest that the second the
20 community feels that they have been
21 traumatized by a male who services them
22 in an emergency situation, I think they
23 need to speak to their rabbis. I think
24 they need to talk to them about it and
25 find out what to do about it. I'm sure

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 that if they sat them down together,
3 they would come to some compromise
4 situation. It's always been that way.

5 But we're not talking about
6 individual feelings now. I respect
7 individual feelings and that person,
8 that woman who has been traumatized, I
9 feel terrible and I understand her 100
10 percent, but that's not the issue, the
11 individual. The issue is the community,
12 the thousands of women who are
13 represented by Hatzalah, the thousands
14 of women who were helped by Hatzalah,
15 the thousands of letters that came into
16 Hatzalah the last 50 years about women
17 who are so grateful and glad to have had
18 such kind of a service. Those are the
19 people that we need to take into the mix
20 also.

21 But I definitely, definitely
22 feel that the woman who does feel
23 traumatized -- we need to help them too.
24 There's no question about it. We need
25 to deal with it, but that's not the

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 issue now. That's a different issue.

3 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: A lot
4 of --

5 MR. DERING: Please, please.
6 Thank you, Rabbi. I appreciate it.

7 MR. REISNER: Rabbi, you've been
8 here for the testimony earlier this
9 evening?

10 RABBI KAUFMAN: Yes.

11 MR. REISNER: And there is
12 testimony that Ezras Nashim was told by
13 the rabbis to start their entity. Did
14 you hear that?

15 RABBI KAUFMAN: Yes.

16 MR. REISNER: What was your take
17 on that?

18 RABBI KAUFMAN: My take on that
19 was, I don't get involved when two
20 rabbis have a dispute, but what I would
21 tell you is that you have to look at the
22 context. I believe that if there's a
23 conflict between rabbis that we need to
24 -- they should sit down and work it out.
25 I do believe that what happened is --

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

this would be my own personal assertion,
I cannot tell you that this is what
happened. Ezras Nashim, it's like the
idea of it, it's like apple pie and
motherhood, you know? People helping
people and so on. And they went to
certain rabbis not in the community,
basically, outside of the community --

(Noise in audience.)

-- rabbis who have signed the
letters. I haven't seen any letters
from the community rabbis. I haven't
seen it. Have any community rabbis
signed? I haven't seen it. I can just
testify from what I've seen. Could have
been they went direct to other rabbis
and they told them about the idea.

In concept, it may be a great
idea. In reality, it smacks in the face
of what we are doing now and the great
services and medical attention that the
community is getting now. So, we have
to somehow bridge the gap between a good
concept and reality. We are talking now

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 about reality, not concepts. Concepts
3 is a different forum, which one day, we
4 may bridge.

5 Believe me, it's very difficult
6 for me to stay here and the reason why
7 it's difficult is because these are my
8 sisters. These are my people, but I
9 must stay with them and they're dieing
10 for the same cause my children will die
11 for. No question about it; however, the
12 same people who interpret the laws of
13 modesty are saying that in this case, we
14 have to overlook that for the moment to
15 save the precious life of a human being.

16 MR. REISNER: Thank you, Rabbi.

17 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Females
18 can also save precious lives.

19 RABBI KAUFMAN: True.

20 MR. DERING: One more question.

21 How come Hatzalah doesn't accept
22 women members?

23 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: If you
24 know --

25 RABBI KAUFMAN: You got another

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 hour of their time?

3 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: No,
4 sir.

5 RABBI KAUFMAN: Look, we're not
6 here to go into the concepts,
7 principles, policies of this wonderful
8 organization, the holy of holiest that
9 Jews have called Hatzalah, as was
10 indicated by all of the woman before who
11 were speaking. We're not going there
12 now, because that's not the right forum.
13 I'll invite you to my house over tea and
14 coffee and I'll invite some other people
15 and then we can talk about it, but this
16 is not the forum.

17 We're here, as you know, to
18 venture a verdict about a new service.
19 This new service is, in our opinion, and
20 my opinion, of the rabbis who signed it,
21 49 rabbis from the community,
22 representing a majority of the
23 constituents of the community, it's of
24 their opinion that this would not be a
25 wise thing to do now.

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 Now, whether they should accept
3 women or not, that's a different,
4 different topic or subject, which I
5 would be glad to talk to you about. How
6 much do you charge?

7 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Does
8 anyone have any questions for the Rabbi?

9 MR. DERING: No.

10 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I want
11 to thank the Rabbi for engaging and
12 thank you for your time.

13 RABBI KAUFMAN: Thank you.

14 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Who do
15 we have next? Jim still had questions
16 and I want to return to your three
17 ladies who Mr. Downey had not finished
18 questioning. I apologize. So we're
19 talking about Ms. Levine, Ms. Pomerantz
20 and Ms. Sprei and Jim has the questions
21 for you. If you would like to either
22 approach or I can provide you with the
23 microphone from where you are. Or if
24 you can, Mr. Dering, if you have the
25 microphone -- do you have it?

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 MR. DERING: Sure.

3 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: You
4 want to bring it over to the ladies?

5 MR. DERING: I'd prefer the
6 three ladies were together so they can
7 answer.

8 (Where upon Ms. Levine,
9 Ms. Pomerantz and Ms. Sprei approached
10 the microphone.)

11 MR. DOWNEY: Thank you very
12 much. On page 8 of the application, 8
13 of 180, section 1, proposed area of
14 service. The proposed area of service
15 for Ezras Nashim Borough Park, Brooklyn.
16 The proposed area covers 2.071 miles and
17 includes Kensington, Bensonhurst, Sunset
18 Park and Ditmas Park.

19 Does Borough Park include Sunset
20 Park, Ditmas park, Kensington? I'll add
21 in the precincts that cover these areas
22 are the 62nd, 66th, 70th, and 72nd
23 precincts. The area is served by the
24 Community Board 7,11,12,13 and 14.
25 Again, are we talking about Borough Park

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 or a much wider area in Brooklyn?

3 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I'm
4 just giving a copy of the application to
5 split.

6 MS. POMERANTZ: Just like Ezras
7 Nashim is a new volunteer emergency
8 service, we're not going to tackle the
9 world. We're not looking to go out of
10 major boundaries. We're focusing on the
11 need in the community and where need is
12 most and that is Borough Park and
13 whatever that mapped out area is that
14 area of need. We're not branching out
15 with our ambulance to any other areas
16 that this time.

17 MR. DOWNEY: All right. In a
18 permanent environment, REMSCO is seeking
19 street boundaries for the area of
20 service of volunteer ambulance cars. In
21 2016, Ezras Nashim submitted an
22 application and it subsequently withdrew
23 it and the proposed area of service
24 includes street boundaries.

25 Is this an accurate description

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 of the street boundaries of Borough
3 Park?

4 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Jim,
5 when you say, "this," you're referring
6 to which page in the application?

7 MR. DOWNEY: I'm referring to
8 the maps in the application that show
9 Borough Park and I'm asking if that's
10 the street boundaries. Please clarify
11 if that's the street boundaries of
12 Borough Park.

13 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: So it's
14 still page 9. So it looks like a whole
15 lot of gray. I'm not sure.

16 MS. LEVINE: (Indiscernible.)

17 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN:
18 Ms. Levine, we're not quite getting you,
19 see which one of these microphones is
20 hot.

21 MS. LEVINE: We're looking at
22 the numbers and it says right here in
23 the application, we would say that
24 Borough Park has expanded over the years
25 and many of the Orthodox Hasidic women

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 or the people live within these streets
3 that it says over here.

4 MR. DOWNEY: Are we looking at
5 the same street boundaries, this set
6 here? Is this an accurate description
7 of Borough Park, that service area that
8 you're asking for?

9 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Jim, is
10 that from the 2016 application?

11 MR. DOWNEY: Again, I'm trying
12 to clarify, is this an accurate
13 description of Borough Park that you're
14 requesting right now?

15 MS. POMERANTZ: That's an old
16 application.

17 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: So we
18 don't have it as the application, and as
19 far as I think Counsel on both sides
20 would agree, we're not looking at the
21 2016 application. So, if you could
22 comment, do you have a map of the
23 service area of the community that you
24 serve?

25 MS. LEVINE: Page 9.

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 MR. DERING: Do you need to
3 consult?

4 MR. DOWNEY: Can you detail for
5 me the street boundaries of that area?

6 MS. POMERANTZ: We can check on
7 that and verify that.

8 MS. SPREI: We'll have to
9 consult on that.

10 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: From a
11 layperson, I'm looking at the map,
12 that's section 1-A, proposed maps and it
13 looks like it's a snapshot of a map from
14 someplace that doesn't necessarily have
15 street boundaries. It appears to be
16 printed upsidedown and I need to take my
17 glasses off.

18 MS. POMERANTZ: We need to
19 consult.

20 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: It's on
21 page 9, but the map is printed
22 upsidedown. All right. So, do you guys
23 have specific meets and bounds? Are you
24 identifying your service area by police
25 precincts?

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 MS. LEVINE: It says right here.

3 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Well,
4 when you say, "right here," so there's a
5 text that states -- I'm going to read it
6 into the record. It says, "proposed
7 area for service" --

8 MS. DIGLIO: The Ambulance
9 Committee can request a clearer map.
10 The one that was submitted is a little
11 difficult to follow and rather than
12 argue over the boundaries here, we
13 should have it as part of our
14 discussion, so if that's something
15 that's okay, we can ask for a clarified
16 map.

17 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I don't
18 think it's resolvable at this point. I
19 don't think it's fair --

20 MR. REISNER: The application
21 must be judged in the four quarters of
22 the document that's submitted. I would
23 respectfully submit given the exchange
24 and in the interest of expediency that
25 the answer is no, that the application

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 does not contain street boundaries.

3 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I
4 agree. And it says the proposed area
5 covers 2.071 miles and I teach this. Is
6 that a radius of 2.071 miles from a
7 certain place? Is it 2.071 square
8 miles?

9 MS. LEVINE: We will have to
10 consult.

11 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I'm
12 going to make a point of fact that it's
13 unclear and again, I'm going to be using
14 this as the four quarters document
15 because it's all I've got. So, that is
16 an issue that -- thank you for bringing
17 that up.

18 MS. DIGLIO: Just to clarify,
19 the application requirements do not ask
20 for street boundaries. That is
21 something new from the Department of
22 Health.

23 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Okay.

24 GENERAL GILLARD: While we
25 understand there is not a need for

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

street boundaries, I think the area of clarification or discrepancy from application to how you're promoting it is you're asking for Borough Park. Borough Park is serviced by the 66th Precinct, CB 12, which is in your application; however, you've exceeded apparently in the application that area and you are going back and forth between Borough Park and all these other communities. So I think we need that clarified as to whether or not you are can asking for Borough Park or a larger area and that's something that I would like to see before I can make a decision on this.

MR. DERING: Do you want to consult with your mother?

MS. LEVINE: Yes.

GENERAL GILLARD: And as well as in your PowerPoint, you show a letter of support from CB 15, which is outside of your Borough Park community. No CB-12 letter of support was provided.

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 MR. DOWNEY: So the proposed
3 operating area still needs to the
4 clarified. Okay. Going on, page 10 of
5 180 talks about expectation of going on
6 grants, \$125,000. Is there any problem
7 -- you do allow men in your
8 organization, because there was a
9 flyer --

10 MS. LEVINE: No, there was no --
11 I don't think there was ever a flyer
12 about having men join. I'm involved in
13 all the social media and I have never
14 made any flyer about having men join.

15 MR. DOWNEY: Okay. Are
16 non-Hasidic women eligible to join?

17 MS. LEVINE: Of course.

18 MR. DOWNEY: So it's open to all
19 religions?

20 (Answer indiscernible due
21 multiple people speaking at a time.)

22 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I'm
23 going to ask that the ladies who are at
24 the podium who are responding should
25 only be the ones responding, despite

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 your passion, and I thank it, but I'm
3 asking you to hold it.

4 MR. DOWNEY: All right. You
5 indicate for the direct operating cost
6 of vehicle insurance of \$4,000. Is that
7 for an ambulance and the three response
8 vehicles that you have? Because that
9 seems to be a very low insurance cost.

10 MS. LEVINE: What page is that?

11 MR. DOWNEY: Page 10.

12 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: It
13 looks like page 11.

14 MR. DOWNEY: I'm seeing page 10
15 of 180.

16 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: It
17 looks like there is vehicle insurance on
18 page 11 of 180. Direct operating cost,
19 third line down, vehicle insurance,
20 \$4,000.

21 MR. ORLANSKI: Could I just
22 provide a point of clarification, if I
23 may? The application that was sent out
24 by Marie and the Regional Council were
25 off by a page from the printed material,

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 so there is stuff that may be on 10 that
3 is now on 11, et cetera, et cetera, so
4 the original application and the printed
5 application page numbering appears to be
6 off by a one.

7 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Thank
8 you.

9 MR. ORLANSKI: That's what I'm
10 here for.

11 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I think
12 the question was, the vehicle insurance
13 of \$4,000, is that an estimate or how
14 was that --

15 MS. LEVINE: So research was
16 done. I didn't do the research on this,
17 but I'll assume it's correct, but I
18 guess we'll have to consult with my
19 mother. A lot of time was spent doing
20 the research on this.

21 MR. DOWNEY: Going down a couple
22 of lines, office expense or staffing,
23 \$47,400 for staffing. Who are the paid
24 members? You're showing \$47,000 for
25 staffing expenses. Who are the paid

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 members?

3 MS. LEVINE: So there's
4 consultants, web designer. We have also
5 secretary, the office staff. For any
6 things for the website, yeah,
7 advertising.

8 MR. DOWNEY: Okay. Moving on.
9 Page 15 of 180 or page 16, whatever it
10 turns out to be, under mutual aid.
11 "Ezras Nashim has a mutual aid agreement
12 with FDNY EMS." What I see is a letter
13 from September of 2018 from FDNY saying
14 that if you call, they will send an
15 ambulance.

16 An agreement normally has
17 signatures of two different parties and
18 there's no second party signing the
19 agreement with FDNY. So, is there a
20 separate mutual aid agreement with FDNY
21 other than this letter of saying you
22 call and we'll send an ambulance?

23 MR. DERING: If I could add, I
24 know that REMSCO was consulted on that
25 and was advised that it is sufficient.

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 MS. DIGLIO: It was presented to
3 the Ambulance Committee and the Regional
4 EMS Council and they accept it as the
5 mutual aid agreement.

6 MR. DOWNEY: Normally, REMSCO
7 wants volunteer agencies to join the
8 REMSCO mutual aid agreement and I
9 believe it says there are no other
10 authorized agreements approved by
11 REMSCO, so this does not satisfy
12 REMSCO's policies. Does Ezras Nashim
13 intend to join the REMSCO mutual aid
14 matrix?

15 MS. DIGLIO: Once -- if this
16 application is approved, that's when
17 they really need to have a signed mutual
18 aid agreement. The mutual aid letter
19 that was provided by the Fire Department
20 was specific to this application. Once
21 they have an ambulance service, which
22 they don't have now, then they can join
23 a mutual aid agreement, so that's why
24 you don't have that here now.

25 MR. DOWNEY: But just to

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 clarify, this page from the FDNY is not
3 a mutual aid agreement?

4 MS. DIGLIO: It's an agreement
5 with the Fire Department that they will
6 respond to their calls like they would
7 respond to anyone. They put it in
8 writing.

9 MR. DOWNEY: Okay. "Ezras
10 Nashim can provide aid and backup
11 emergency services to other agencies as
12 well." This is if they are branded an
13 ambulance operating certificate. Will
14 you be available to handle all calls?
15 Normally, the Fire Department reaches
16 out to volunteers in cases of disaster,
17 flood situations, emergencies. Would
18 you be participating in those types of
19 mutual aid calls?

20 MS. SPREI: I will gladly
21 participate. I participate in many
22 volunteer -- different services. I have
23 no problem with that.

24 MR. DOWNEY: All right. I just
25 noticed on the same page, "women are

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 focused on modesty and have a strong
3 preference." And later on in that page,
4 "women nevertheless, feel more
5 comfortable being cared for by a woman."
6 All right. Page 17, you're requesting a
7 single ambulance. Actually, REMSCO does
8 not deal with the number of ambulances
9 that a service has once if a certificate
10 is granted, you can have one, you can
11 have 50 if you want. If you're only
12 having starting off with one, do you
13 have a backup plan if that is out of
14 service?

15 MS. POMERANTZ: FDNY currently
16 services our calls and they have agreed
17 to continue to be our backup in the
18 event that we need a secondary
19 ambulance. However our system operates
20 now, they would be secondary to that.

21 MR. DOWNEY: Do you have any
22 idea where your ambulance will be posted
23 within the Borough Park area?

24 MS. POMERANTZ: You mean parked?

25 MR. DOWNEY: Parked or garaged.

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 MS. POMERANTZ: We have a
3 location. It's not on the street.

4 MR. DOWNEY: It will be on the
5 street?

6 MS. POMERANTZ: No, no. Not.
7 It's not on the street. It's in a
8 driveway.

9 MR. DOWNEY: In a driveway.
10 Where in Borough Park would be it
11 posted?

12 MS. LEVINE: 17-60 56th Street.

13 MR. DOWNEY: Thank you. The
14 current fly cars that you have, the
15 Suburban and the Chrysler Pacific, are
16 they equipped with emergency lights and
17 sirens?

18 MS. POMERANTZ: I believe they
19 are fully loaded with lights and sirens.

20 MR. DOWNEY: Under what part of
21 the motor vehicle and traffic law are
22 they authorized to operate?

23 MS. POMERANTZ: They have the --

24 MS. LEVINE: Yeah, they have a
25 light and a siren they're allowed to use

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 until we get the --

3 MR. DOWNEY: My understanding is
4 it has to be an ambulance service that
5 designates emergency ambulance service
6 vehicles.

7 MS. LEVINE: Yeah, we are
8 allowed to use a yellow light and
9 certain like beeping sound
10 (indiscernible).

11 MR. DOWNEY: But they are not
12 legal emergency vehicles at the present
13 time?

14 MS. POMERANTZ: That's because
15 we have a BLSFR, first response, and
16 this is not a VAS right now.

17 MR. DOWNEY: But they're not
18 designated as emergency vehicles by an
19 ambulance service. I believe this a
20 requirement on a motor vehicle and
21 traffic law.

22 MS. POMERANTZ: We're going to
23 have to find that out.

24 MR. DOWNEY: Okay. Page 31,
25 "members are required to participate in

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 FDNY ride-alongs." Do you know if
3 that's offered to all volunteer services
4 or was it just offered to Ezras Nashim?

5 MS. POMERANTZ: Can you repeat
6 the question?

7 MR. DOWNEY: Page 31, "members
8 are required to participate in FDNY
9 ride-alongs and observe EMTs in action."
10 Is that available to all volunteers or
11 is it a special program for Ezras
12 Nashim?

13 MS. LEVINE: We do have a
14 program to have our EMTs go on
15 ride-alongs. I don't know about other
16 EMTs. I know that we have that.

17 MR. DOWNEY: Page 113 of 180
18 actually, page 113 of 126, "proof of
19 donations." Were these donations to
20 Ezras Nashim, specifically or the parent
21 organization?

22 MS. LEVINE: Ezras Nashim,
23 specifically.

24 MR. DOWNEY: All right. It
25 doesn't show it there. And the list of

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 supporters that signed a petition, do
3 you have a breakdown of the number from
4 Borough Park versus the number from the
5 rest of the world?

6 MS. LEVINE: We don't have that
7 differentiation.

8 MR. DOWNEY: Then from looking
9 it over, the number would be much less
10 than the total number. I think one last
11 question. The 300 or so calls that
12 Ezras Nashim responded to in to 2018,
13 how many of those involved childbirth in
14 the field?

15 MS. POMERANTZ: I would have to
16 look at the records. Every call gets
17 logged and we have to go back to calls
18 and pull those up. We have a system
19 where we can pull up the nature of the
20 calls and we can provide that.

21 MR. DOWNEY: Normally, those are
22 memorable because they don't happen too
23 often, but out of the 300, you don't
24 have a two, 10, 20?

25 MS. POMERANTZ: I don't always

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

know about it. I'm the overnight charge member, so what happens during the day, I don't necessarily know -- when I come on shift -- you know, we're confidential and it's not something that I'm always aware of, but we can find that out based on our calls dispatched.

MS. LEVINE: Can I add something? I wouldn't know the nature of a lot of the calls since, you know, the HIPAA laws, but I do know that we get a lot of knocks to our door, chocolate platters and flowers with letters that say thank you so much for delivering my baby. And I walk with my mother a lot in the street and people have their carriage and they point and they say, "you delivered this baby. So, that's why we know that we did respond to a nice number of childbirths.

MR. DOWNEY: All right. You're at present a BLS first response agency. What are your plans for ALS backup if you're approved?

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 MS. POMERANTZ: We start out as
3 BLS and we will hopefully grow to ALS,
4 but we have to start out first with the
5 basic.

6 MR. DOWNEY: If you're approved
7 as a BLS ambulance service what are your
8 plans for the ALS service? REMSCO REMAC
9 has a number of protocols that require
10 an ALS response to be requested to the
11 scene. Would you be calling 911 for
12 that or do you have another service that
13 will provide ALS response where
14 appropriate?

15 MS. SPREI: We do have two
16 paramedics. There are two paramedics.

17 MR. DOWNEY: All right. New
18 York State does not allow a paramedic to
19 operate as a paramedics on a BLS
20 ambulance.

21 MS. POMERANTZ: They don't
22 operate as the paramedics now. Before
23 we get to the next step, we will have
24 paramedics lined up. We have ongoing
25 training EMT courses being run in

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 different communities for people that
3 would like to eventually join in the
4 expansion of this project. Right now,
5 we're at the basic level.

6 MR. ORLANSKI: Could I just
7 clarify Jim's question please, I think,
8 if I may? Right now, if you get
9 approved and you need paramedics, what
10 is the plan? You're on a call and you
11 need paramedics, what is the plan?

12 MS. POMERANTZ: Well, we have
13 the FDNY backup. Right now, we don't
14 have an ambulance service and we're not
15 an ALS agency. So we do have the backup
16 of FDNY.

17 MR. ORLANSKI: Thank you.

18 MR. DOWNEY: The women that call
19 you, do they understand that the crew
20 may not be able to handle all situations
21 at the EMT level and FDNY may be called
22 in to assist?

23 MS. SPREI: They definitely know
24 that and that's why some of them are not
25 so happy. They would prefer we have our

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 own ambulance.

3 MR. DOWNEY: Thank you very
4 much.

5 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Other
6 members of the committee?

7 MR. REISNER: May I approach?

8 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Please.

9 MR. REISNER: Ma'am, there's
10 been some testimony that you don't
11 accept men into your ranks. I'm showing
12 you what has been previously submitted
13 as Exhibit H, Chevra Hatzalah's
14 opposition papers.

15 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN:
16 Mr. Reisner, you're addressing
17 Ms. Levine?

18 MR. REISNER: Yes.

19 Do you recognize this document?

20 MS. LEVINE: No, actually, I
21 don't. And I'm just going to say about
22 ads, we actually just had last week
23 somebody created an Ezras Nashim ad that
24 was not from us and it was about like --
25 like I know -- now, I do all the

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 advertising and somebody created an ad.
3 I guess -- I don't know what they were
4 trying to do, but it wasn't from us.
5 So, this, I don't know. I've never seen
6 this.

7 MR. REISNER: What's in the top
8 right corner; is that your logo?

9 MS. LEVINE: Yeah, yeah. I've
10 seen this.

11 MR. REISNER: And can you read
12 what's in the bottom right corner for me
13 in the small print?

14 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN:

15 Mr. Reisner, this is in the
16 application?

17 MR. REISNER: No, it's in my
18 opposition.

19 MS. LEVINE: I have never seen
20 it.

21 MR. REISNER: Could you read it
22 for me, please?

23 MS. LEVINE: Yeah, it says,
24 "looking for men volunteer ambulance
25 drivers." I have never seen it. It

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 could be -- if it's true, but if they
3 would want men as driver's then that
4 would be as a driver, not interfering
5 with the call itself. I'm saying it
6 could be, but I've never seen it.

7 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Any
8 other questions from the committee for
9 the ladies that are present before us?

10 (No responses.)

11 I again, thank you for your time
12 and testimony here this evening. Who do
13 we have up next?

14 MR. DERING: So next, Hearing
15 Officer, we have Leah Betesh.

16 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN:
17 Ms. Betesh, where are you? You have to
18 come forward.

19 (Whereupon, Ms. Betesh
20 approached the microphone.)

21 MR. REISNER: Quick
22 clarification, is this a witness on
23 behalf of the community or the
24 applicant?

25 MR. DERING: She's on behalf of

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 the applicant.

3 MR. REISNER: Thank you.

4 MR. DERING: And then we have
5 one more and then that's it.

6 MS. BETESH: Good evening,
7 everyone. I will try to be brief.

8 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Are you
9 a member of Ezras Nashim?

10 MS. BETESH: I'm a volunteer
11 dispatcher.

12 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Thank
13 you.

14 MS. BETESH: My name is Leah
15 Betesh Rubenstein and I'm, as I said
16 before, a volunteer and my husband and I
17 are part of the Hasidic community in
18 Borough Park (indiscernible). I would
19 to like to tell a brief story when I
20 lived in Israel 26 years ago. I think
21 it's important when trauma is the issue
22 here.

23 26 years ago, I lived in a
24 settlement called Ely. It is about an
25 hour away from Jerusalem (indiscernible)

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 surrounded by hostile villages. Sorry.
3 English is not my first language.

4 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: You're
5 doing fine.

6 MS. BETESH: Thank you. So I
7 was going into labor and we had an
8 ambulance from the next settlement,
9 which is Shiloh (phonetic) and the
10 journey by itself was dangerous and the
11 ambulance, they were men and this was
12 quite a traumatic experience for me,
13 because I already was nervous about the
14 journey. It was one hour and then being
15 tended by men, I was not Hasidic back
16 then. I was Orthodox and still, I felt
17 compelled to have women next to me
18 because I was giving my second
19 childbirth and how they tried to examine
20 me to prepare me for giving birth and I
21 was withholding a child, I didn't want
22 to give birth because I didn't want to
23 be exposed to men.

24 MR. REISNER: Objection.

25 MS. BETESH: I was raised in a

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 traditional Jewish family with Jewish
3 values, and the modesty (indiscernible)
4 I was not going to compromise my values
5 and expose my body as someone else also
6 mentioned.

7 MR. REISNER: Objection.

8 Hearing officer --

9 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN:
10 Ms. Betesh, let me listen for a moment
11 to Mr. Reisner.

12 MR. REISNER: I would ask you to
13 limit the testimony to that which is
14 within the four quarters of the
15 application and most notably to
16 occurrences involving the local --

17 MS. BETESH: Well, if you let me
18 finish.

19 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Just
20 give me a second.

21 MR. REISNER: The need as
22 present or not present in this country.
23 My understanding is this testimony, it's
24 about an incident in Israel several
25 years ago and I'm having trouble seeing

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 the relevance as to how it goes to need.
3 MR. DERING: Hearing Officer,
4 can I speak on that?
5 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Yes.
6 MR. DERING: It goes to the
7 issue of modesty. It doesn't matter
8 it's here or somewhere else.
9 MS. BETESH: It's not even about
10 modesty. It's about the emotional
11 trauma. Because I had surgery 20 years
12 after this because I was retaining the
13 child. I didn't want to give birth
14 because I didn't want to expose my body.
15 So my birth canal and I'm sorry to say
16 this here in front of an audience, but I
17 think it's important. My birth canal
18 completely tore and went like this
19 (indicating) and like, not knowing what
20 happened to my body and was not
21 repaired. I had repaired surgery
22 20 years after, so I went through the
23 trauma twice. And I was not Hasidic
24 back then. I was only Orthodox and
25 scared. That's all I have to say.

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 Thank you.

3 (Whereupon, applause was given.)

4 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Any
5 further questions?

6 MR. REISNER: No thank you.

7 MR. DERING: And our last
8 witness, David Freier.

9 (Whereupon David Freier
10 approached the microphone.)

11 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Good
12 evening.

13 MR. FREIER: Good evening,
14 Hearing Officer and members of the
15 Ambulance Committee. Thank you for
16 taking the time to be here. Let me tell
17 you, initially, I did not want my wife
18 to do this. I was worried that I would
19 get pressure in the community, which I
20 did, and had no time to deal with, but
21 once I got involved, I could not turn
22 back.

23 It all started when my wife,
24 Ruchie, got a call in the summer of 2011
25 asking for free legal help from a group

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 of Hasidic women who were EMTs and
3 douglas and were not allowed to join
4 Hatzalah. My wife was not sure about
5 this group and discussed the request
6 with me. At first, she thought this may
7 be a group of trouble makers and said to
8 me that she is going to do some
9 research, including interviewing women
10 who experienced trauma who were treated
11 by all men EMTs.

12 We heard that in New Square, a
13 Hasidic community in Rockland County,
14 whose rabbi has thousands of followers
15 around the world, including a large
16 following in Borough Park opened a
17 women's division in the local square of
18 Brunswick. I went with Ruchie to the
19 rabbi of Square and he explained to us
20 how important it is to have a division
21 of women EMTs in Hatzalah. He
22 emphasized that women of his town came
23 to him crying over the shame and trauma
24 of having their babies delivered in the
25 hands by men of the community. He

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 further explained how he was going to
3 expand the responsibilities of women
4 EMTs to handle all female-related
5 emergencies. Not just childbirth. He
6 encouraged us to go get involved in this
7 issue.

8 Although this very
9 (indiscernible) was very determined, I
10 was still not convinced that Ruchie and
11 I should get involved, so my next trip
12 to Israel and I go twice a year, I
13 decided to meet with the supreme leading
14 rabbis of the Jewish world, see the two
15 photos in the application on page 5 and
16 a handwritten letters of endorsement --
17 if you go to page 5, two pictures, one
18 is in the library and I didn't bring
19 them all I have. I have a collection of
20 20 rabbis, but I couldn't put them all.
21 And the handwritten letters of
22 endorsement in Hebrew translated to
23 English on page 131 to 137. It's just
24 my way of telling you that these rabbis
25 that I went are the biggest, like

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

Supreme Court, these are the biggest, biggest around. The one I went to, his father-in-law, his name was Olioshi (phonetic) in the letter was the biggest (indiscernible), were not well. They brought them for \$100,000 the doctor had to fly down to (indiscernible). I'm just saying these are not just rabbis.

To our surprise, the leading rabbis of Israel were even more determined that Ruchie and I get involved in this mission. In fact, in Israel today, the United Hatzalah of Israel under the leadership of Eric Beard (phonetic) has opened a division for religious women. I find it surprising that all the rabbis who signed the letter opposing Ezras Nashim, which was submitted by opposition, not even one of them reached out to me to hear our side, which is a fundamental requirement under Jewish law.

In fact, a few rabbis approached me saying that they were asked to sign

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

the letter -- because the delegation was going around to everyone, but refused to do so before talking to me. One rabbi told me he refused to sign because he supports us, but due to the political climate, he is not ready to support us publicly. That's not just one. I can tell you maybe 20 of them.

By the way, he mentions 48 signatures. Do you know how many rabbis there are in Borough Park? Like 150 to 250 or more. He got 48 signatures. Because my wife is careful with following HIPAA laws, I don't know about Ezras Nashim's calls. Ezras Nashim calls, I don't know, but let me tell you what I do know: That countless men come up to me in the synagogue or in the street, thanking me for Ezras Nashim, helping my wife, helping their wife, daughter or the elderly mother. This has happened every day.

I also know of the cases which unfolded in my presence when I was with

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

Ruchie together. I'll give you just one example. It's late, I wish there was more time, more people would have been here, but I will give you one example of many cases without identifying details. Like I said, I can't say of what happened on Shabbas, the weekend, afternoon in our bungalow.

Some children came banging, this was in the afternoon, banging on the door, urging my wife to come help. A young woman had an emergency in the neighboring bungalow. The parents panicked and called the local Hatzalah, but the other children thought of calling Ruchie. My wife ran over to assist the young woman. While doing so, a Hatzalah arrived.

By that time, a crowd had formed in front of the bungalow. I was there with my friends and neighbors. The young woman was inside with Ruchie when the male EMTs arrived and entered the bedroom from outside. We all heard her

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

shrieking. She sounded traumatized. We heard the parents ask the Hatzalah members to give Ruchie some time to see if she could see if she could resolve the issue; it would be a few minutes.

The EMTs were encouraging the parents to allow them to transfer their daughter to the local hospital to be sedated. We all watched. They made the EMTs wait outside the bungalow and minutes later, the young woman walked out smiling and relieved. This is not a made up story.

We all rejoiced and talked about what a difference it can make when women treat women during emergencies. We know that there are Jewish laws related to physical contact between men and women. We also know there are exceptions to the law in times of life-threatening emergencies; however, what you may not know is the culture of modesty and how and it's promoted and manifests itself in the Hasidic community. That

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

countless of religious books and protocols that teach women and girls to avoid male doctors and male medical professionals unless there is a life-threatening emergency. Therefore, many women delay calling for help because they are in doubt whether or not they are having true life-threatening emergencies. This alone is life-threatening.

Thank you all for your courtesy and generosity allowing me to explain how an ambulance license for Ezras Nashim will meet the needs of the religious community of Borough Park, which includes keeping patients calm as well as healthy women. This is very important now. Women who are under any circumstance regardless of their rabbinical exception of the modesty rule will not call a male EMT. That's a fact, a lot of them.

Secondly, women who follow the rabbinical exception to the modesty rule

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 during life-threatening emergencies and
3 they wait. The problem is they wait
4 until the condition escalates to a
5 life-threatening emergency before
6 calling for help.

7 MR. REISNER: Objection.

8 There is no proof of that.

9 MR. FREIER: I want to finish
10 and then you talk. Third thing, women
11 who follow the rabbinical exception to
12 modesty rule -- have a seat.

13 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I'm
14 going to ask the gentleman to be
15 respectful. I think we've been
16 respectful up until this point and I'm
17 going to accept what is being said as
18 opinion and will take it as opinion.
19 I'm not taking it as fact. I am going
20 to insist on civility here and I
21 understand passion is present, but I
22 think civility must remain here as well.

23 MR. FREIER: The third thing is,
24 women who follow the rabbinical
25 exception to the modesty rule during

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 life-threatening emergencies, but lack
3 the knowledge and training to make such
4 a determination. So they don't call for
5 help. I hope and pray that you
6 respected members of the Ambulance
7 Committee recognize the fact that so
8 many women with unmet needs and
9 pre-hospital and emergency care who
10 until now had no voice and have waited
11 for this very day and turned to you for
12 help. Thank you and God bless you.

13 (Whereupon, applause was given.)
14 I'm sorry for that.

15 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Any
16 questions?

17 MR. REISNER: One line of
18 questioning. I'm not going to promise
19 you one question. A lawyer never lives
20 up to that promise.

21 MR. FREIER: Ask me.

22 MR. REISNER: Yes, very briefly.
23 You mentioned earlier in your testimony
24 that you and your wife went to speak to
25 a rabbi about the founding principles of

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 Ezras Nashim, correct?

3 MR. FREIER: Yes, correct.

4 MR. REISNER: Where was that
5 rabbi?

6 MR. FREIER: Okay. Let me
7 explain you. The rabbi is not in
8 Borough Park. He's in Square. Do you
9 know where Square is? Exit 11 on
10 Palisades, but if you saw, I wrote,
11 where are all of his followers? He has
12 thousands in there and I has 1,000 in
13 Borough Park alone. He's a rabbi that
14 people coming from all over, waiting.
15 Like I could say you come every night,
16 he would have 100 people waiting to
17 discuss with him that are from England,
18 Israel coming because he's a very smart
19 man and if he opened in his place and he
20 was begging us how important it is to
21 have this. I would not even think about
22 this.

23 Every time we came to visit him,
24 he asked my wife, what are you up to?
25 It was shocking to see this. Now, you

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 are saying about that. There's other
3 rabbis in Borough Park that I have, but
4 you have to understand, I do not
5 publicize those rabbis, because there's
6 a reason for that. If you want to hear
7 it, I could say.

8 MR. REISNER: That's quite all
9 right. You answered my question. My
10 question was simply whether he was local
11 to Borough Park. You answered that.

12 MR. FREIER: He is not local to
13 Borough Park.

14 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I'm
15 going to reinforce what you're saying.
16 Mr. Freier, when the question is asked,
17 I'm going to, politely and with respect,
18 ask you to answer only the question and
19 don't take it as a diving board to go
20 swimming a few laps in the pool and just
21 focus on the question.

22 MR. REISNER: And what I hope is
23 my last question is: Did that rabbi
24 reach out to Hatzalah about their
25 position on Ezras Nashim before giving

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 you his advice?

3 MR. FREIER: No, he did not
4 reach out.

5 MR. REISNER: Thank you.

6 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Any
7 questions? Rabbi, we thank you for your
8 time.

9 MR. FREIER: Thank you for
10 listening.

11 MR. REISNER: I believe we're do
12 for one. We have a midwife present.

13 MR. FREIER: I want to say just
14 one thing as for Borough Park because
15 earlier you asked this question and
16 mentioned about Borough Park rabbis.
17 There are a lot of rabbis that with
18 truth -- because if you want to hear it,
19 let them hear it -- that they're
20 threatened, so they have no choice, so
21 they have to back-pedal. This is going
22 on for the last few years.

23 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Thank
24 you for your time and you said you have
25 another witness who is --

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 MR. REISNER: Yes, I do.

3 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Ma'am,
4 I can't remember your name.

5 MS. DVORKES: Ms. Dvorkes.

6 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: And it
7 looks like you're a nurse, Ms. Dvorkes?

8 MS. DVORKES: Midwife.

9 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: It
10 says, "RN, CNM." What is a CNM?

11 MS. DVORKES:

12 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: And the
13 lady who is standing to your left?

14 MS. DVORKES: This is
15 Dr. Melinda Mann. We work together.

16 DR. MANN: I'm not one of the
17 speakers. I'm a fill-in.

18 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I'm
19 fine. Can you just say your name and
20 spell it for us so we have it for the
21 record?

22 DR. MANN: Dr. Melinda M-A-N-N.

23 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: Thank
24 you.

25 MS. DVORKES: My name is Sara

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 Dvorkes. I'm a certified nurse midwife
3 and this is Dr. Melinda Mann. We both,
4 each of us --

5 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN:
6 Dr. Dvorkes, you're going to forgive me
7 for interrupting. I do not mean to be
8 rude. Dr. Mann, you are an M.D., D.O.?
9 What is your doctorate in? Philosophy?

10 DR. MANN: I'm a board-certified
11 physician in obstetrics and gynecology.

12 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: So
13 you're the real deal.

14 DR. MANN: So is Ms. Dvorkes.

15 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: And I
16 don't mean to diminish Ms. Dvorkes
17 either.

18 MS. DVORKES: Each of us both
19 has given 25 years to Maimonides
20 Hospital doing the sole work of
21 obstetrics and gynecology. I myself do
22 over 300 deliveries a year, which means
23 we also do home births. Dr. Mann, is
24 part of a group, so I'm sure she does
25 150 a year, which puts me in the

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 hospital over 350 days of that year,
3 which means that we see a lot.

4 This is no hearsay. Whatever we
5 say is fact. I'm not a drama queen.
6 I'm not going to become overly
7 passionate. I'm not going to dramatize
8 anything. Whatever I have is recorded
9 in my personal statistics, available to
10 anybody. We keep a log sheet of every
11 single delivery, no matter who does it
12 or wherever it's done, as far as my own
13 patients are concerned.

14 Doing over 300 deliveries a
15 year, it comes down to some of these
16 women who are (indiscernible) and have
17 large babies, who deliver very quickly
18 do need help. Not all of them can
19 deliver in the hospital. They just
20 don't make it even two blocks away.
21 Statistically speaking, my personal
22 practice, about one percent of the
23 deliveries done by Hatzalah, which mean
24 three to four a year, approximately.

25 Because I'm a solo practitioner,

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

I know these patients from their first baby to their 12th baby. I know them from day one of their conception to the date of their delivery pretty intimately, and probably in the details of their private lives, public lives and medical lives. Hatzalah gives me many, many transports also, not just deliveries and the reason that I have many transports and not deliveries is because of the response time. The response sometime is absolutely remarkable.

Every patient delivered or transported by Hatzalah, I go over and I ask them, how did it go? Were they proper? Were they modest? Were you traumatized? I haven't heard anybody as far as delivery or transport ever use the word "emotional rape." I was shocked to hear that word. Anyone who is having a baby is emotional and traumatic. It's a traumatizing experience in your own doctor's hands,

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

but thank God we have someone who is there to do what they have to do. In short, I think what Dr. Mann and I both agree is that Hatzalah is a three-word slogan called "well-oiled machine."

Number one, let me tell you something: A patient who is about to deliver, does not want Hatzalah. Trust me. They don't want a man. They don't want anyone. They don't want a female EMT either. They want their own doctor. They want no one touching them anywhere. What they do want to do, they want to be transported, period. The second choice is that the baby's coming, we have no choice, then Hatzalah is there, but the first choice is not to have Hatzalah deliver them.

Timing, their timing is absolutely unbelievable, which is the reason why some of many patients are transported before they are delivered. Anyone else traveling, getting my children to school, went to 14th Avenue

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 to 15th Avenue in rush hour, on a
3 holiday or the eve of a holiday in our
4 community, the traffic, the shopping,
5 the school buses, the cars, the people,
6 it takes almost 20 minutes to go three
7 blocks. I'm talking from personal
8 experience.

9 I ask them pointblank: How on
10 Earth do you get these patients into my
11 labor room so quickly? And the answer
12 was: We have seven ambulances in seven
13 strategic spots all across Borough Park.
14 Response time from phone call to
15 delivered into my hands and sometimes I
16 deliver them in the hallway, but they
17 come to me. I get them. It's about two
18 minutes. The skill and expertise, and
19 most of all, it's the experience that
20 they have -- 50 years of experience.
21 It's not the education. It's not the
22 qualifications. It's not the patients.
23 It's not their hand holding. It's not
24 their training. It's their experience
25 that's doing it.

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

I know I, myself, would not want to have a doctor who just graduated medical school do a heart transplant on me. I want 50 years of expertise behind that. If you're going to save my live, give me your expertise, please. Give me your best. Even a cashier in a community like Borough Park -- we're congested, we're dense, we're intense, very intense -- but even the cashier in the grocery store needs expertise because the line starts from here all the way down to the kazoo.

Number two, we have a big advantage with Hatzalah guys. They have muscles. A patient delivered in a bathtub and I was in the hospital when she was delivering, she was brought in by Hatzalah and I heard she delivered in her bathtub for whatever the reason was. Two men came in. She was covered. She was in her bathrobe, they lifted her out, put her on a stretcher and off we went.

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

We needed the men with the muscles and that's something we can't overlook. We can't afford for someone else to come deliver them while she has the placenta inside and bleeding at the same time. With that, with the lifting up and taking her on the stretcher and taking her to the bathtub and off they go, yes, it was traumatizing, but you know something? We've survived worst things.

My parents were holocaust survivors. They survived that. Having a male deliver you, I can't see it as emotional rape or traumatizing experiencing without actually exaggerating the amount (indiscernible). They were there. They did their job. They delivered you. They went home. End of sentence. I can't write a book about that. It was done. Why are we suffering 30 years later for this with all kinds of trauma. I really don't understand this.

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

There is nobody that can -- one of the ladies that spoke here made a comment about you can't call response time from when you make the phone call to when they're delivered to the hospital. It doesn't count. You have to count the hours beforehand. Who in labor is waiting hours that if it's only 20 minutes -- a car service to Borough Park takes five minutes to come and five get to the hospital and Hatzalah is our two-minute call. So they have a choice. I can't see anything replacing what they're doing. I have the greatest respect for them.

I have the greatest respect for Ezras Nashim and what they're trying to accomplish; I really do. I've unfortunately have a couple of experiences with them with one of my patients and I didn't want to air any dirty laundry, but since unfortunately some of your people said things about us so I will speak (Hebrew term), mutual.

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

When one of my patients was hemorrhaging at home and I went to see her and she informed me that an EMT arrived and said we need to transport this lady and the response was, "okay. I'll get transport." Five minutes later, which was not Hatzalah's response time, nobody was there and she was literally pouring out bleeding on the floor. I said, "who did you call?" "My ambulance." "Who did you call?" "My ambulance."

End of the story was, I went over to the phone, called Hatzalah. The men came up and they said to me, "is she stable?" I said, "no, she needs to be transported." (Indiscernible) assess and take her blood pressure, I assume she's not even transported. She's got to be transported. They got her on the stretcher, covered her, downstairs into the ambulance, and she was already on the way when the other ambulance arrived. When I got to the hospital because I went by foot, I said, "just

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

1 get in there. I'll be there soon." She
2 was in the emergency room and we had
3 already ordered blood to be transfused
4 for her and I went to look at the bag of
5 blood, it was O negative. O negative,
6 you have no time to cross match to find
7 out the patient's blood. Had she gotten
8 there five minutes later, I would have
9 been minus one patient. I just
10 delivered her baby about three months
11 ago, so she barely survived enough to
12 have another child in our community.

14 Dr. Mann has a story that she
15 told me today that she's going to tell
16 you about an emergency that she had when
17 Hatzalah was transporting a patient with
18 severe pre-eclampsia. The doctors had
19 made the decision, told Hatzalah, bring
20 her to the labor floor. We didn't see
21 that patient. Hatzalah did. The
22 expertise that they have and experience
23 they have, told them no labor floor,
24 emergency room and when Dr. Mann heard
25 that she was going there, she took the

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

2 bag with all her knives and all her
3 equipment and tell them what you did.

4 MR. DERING: Before we go, can I
5 ask some questions?

6 DR. MANN: I need to make a
7 comment because --

8 HEARING OFFICER SCHORN: I'm
9 going to let Dr. Mann speak and then you
10 can ask questions.

11 DR. MANN: This meeting has a
12 specific goal in determining if Ezras
13 Nashim should be having an ambulance for
14 transporting patients. As a physician,
15 I rode on the bus -- we don't even call
16 it an ambulance, we call it a bus. I've
17 ridden on many bus rides to the
18 hospital. It's an incredible
19 responsibility requiring a very
20 high-degree of skill, and the way that
21 Hatzalah acquires this skill is by
22 mentoring, by riding along when they're
23 less experienced, and by having a
24 tremendous volume and seeing a vast
25 array of all types of problems, some of

REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM

which are exceedingly rare and it is the rare problems that can also be the most life-threatening. So if Ezras Nashim is interested in this, they have to demonstrate competency in pikuach nefesh [saving lives].

We didn't use the word pikuach nefesh tonight and I'm speaking for women here and with respect to Rabbi Freier, he mentioned many times about how people complimented Ezras Nashim, about all the help that they gave, but he didn't use the word "save." We're here to save lives. If Ezras Nashim can demonstrate that they can save lives by doing what Hatzalah has been doing for so long, I'm willing to listen to it, but right now, I don't see it. And I'm a physician in the community. We have an aging population, morbidly obese, multiple comorbidities, seizures, strokes, hemorrhages, heart attacks in our pregnant patients and we have to be prepared to save those lives. Please

1 REMSCO HEARING - EZRAS NASHIM
2 tell me that you can to it and then I'm
3 willing to listen.

4 The story of this Hatzalah
5 diversion is the one that Ms. Dvorkes is
6 talking about. I was the attending on
7 labor and delivery and we got the call
8 from Hatzalah and were bringing in a
9 critically ill patient of Dr. Krom
10 (phonetic) who had pre-eclampsia and
11 they made an independent decision to
12 divert her to the emergency room because
13 she was so ill.

14 I figured out that they weren't
15 coming to the labor room and I ran down
16 with my team, including a tower to do an
17 emergency C-section. In walked a woman,
18 who had full pulmonary edema -- excuse
19 me, not walked. She was almost
20 unconscious. They rolled her in. She
21 was becoming unconscious and in another
22 five minutes, she was unconscious and
23 Hatzalah brought her in. She needed to
24 be intubated. She was obtunded. She
25 didn't even know what was happening to